Open Access Review article



IMPACT OF COVID-19 PANDEMIC ON TEACHING AND LEARNING IN EDUCATIONAL STATUS OF SINDH.

Farzana Mallah¹, Kamlesh Kumar Ahuja ², Laraib Memon³, Mumtaz Ali Chutto ⁴, Vishamber Lal Rohra ⁵, Waseem Raja Memon⁶.

ABSTRACT

The COVID-19 epidemic has disrupted educational systems in more than 200 nations and affected nearly 1.6 billion students, which is a record-breaking number. The closing of schools, foundations, and other educational institutions has had an effect on more than 94 percent of the world's pupils. As a result, everything in our life has changed considerably. Social isolation and constrictive developmental environments have profoundly disturbed traditional educational systems. Once a restriction has been eliminated, going back to school presents a test with numerous newly developed standard operating procedures. Numerous scientists who were working within the confines of the COVID-19 outbreak have shared their experiences with instructional learning in a number of ways. Only a few institutions, universities, and schools now provide one-on-one instruction. Losing the 2020 academic year or much more in the foreseeable future is a cause for concern. The development of the elective school system and the application of evaluation techniques are of highest importance. We now have a great opportunity to prepare to give advanced learning thanks to the COVID-19 pandemic. This essay seeks to present a complete examination of the COVID-19 epidemic's effects on online education and the learning of diverse papers, as well as to present future directions.

KEYWORDS: Web Use, Learning, Pedagogy, Teaching (Academic)

- 1. Ph.D scholar, University of Sindh.
- 2. Assistant professor, Medicine, SMBBMU Larkana.
- 3. Lecturer pathology, PUMHSW, SBA.
- 4. Associate professor, Medicine, SMBBMU Larkana.
- 5. Senior registrar Medicine, SMBBMU Larkana.
- 6. Assistant professor, Medicine, PUMHSW SBA.

Corresponding Author: Farzana Mallah¹ Ph.D Scholar, University of Sindh.

Email: farzanamallah786@yahoo.com

How to cite this article: Mallah F¹, Ahuja KK ², Memon L³, Chutto MA ⁴, Rohra VL ⁵, Memon WR ⁶. **IMPACT OF COVID-19 PANDEMIC ON TEACHING AND LEARNING IN EDUCATIONAL STATUS OF SINDH.** *JPUMHS*; 2022:12:02, 33-39.

http://doi.org/10.46536/jpumhs/2022/12.02.356

Received April 09 2022, Accepted On 15 June 2022, Published On 30 June 2022.

INTRODUCTION

Nearly all nations and areas have been impacted by the worldwide COVID-19 pandemic flare-up. In December 2019, Wuhan, China, reported the occurrence. The world's governments issued a warning to society, urging it to pay heed and behave appropriately. The general public has advised hand washing, face coverings, physical separation, and avoiding mass meetings and gatherings. ¹

Lockdown protocols and a necessity to stay at home have been devised to restore order and stop the illness's spread. For the second week of March 2020, Bhutan initially declared the closure of schools and other institutions as well as a shortening of business hours. ²

On August 1, 2020, the entire cross-country shutdown started. In the middle, construction projects received approval, companies started up, some grade levels went back to school, while other students continued taking classes online. ³

The end of school has an impact on more than 170,000 kids in Bhutan who are in grades PP through XII at the moment. It has been challenging to adjust during this school year and the foreseeable future due to the extensive impact. A few institutions, universities, and schools no longer offer inperson training. It is urgently necessary to enhance and develop optional instructional and evaluation procedures. ⁴

The COVID-19 pandemic has given us the chance to prepare for computer-based learning. A few instances of specific research gaps include the data gap, an unfavorable home environment for learning, value, and academic achievement in terms of advanced education. The limitations of the framework for online training and the instructors' limited interest in using the internet for instruction are other areas of weakness. This essay assesses how the COVID-19 epidemic has affected worldwide education and learning. During the COVID-19 epidemic, the opportunities and difficulties of online learning are gathered, and a course of action is offered. ⁵

Education for Ongoing **Teaching** concluded Connected

Lockdown and social severing measures brought on by the COVID-19 epidemic have resulted in the closure of schools, preparation groups, and offices for advanced education in a number of countries. ⁶

Teachers now provide high-quality instruction through a variety of internetbased stages. The unique global epidemic can now be treated with online learning, remote education, and continuing your education despite the difficulties that both teachers and students must encounter. ⁷

With relatively few alternatives accessible, the transition from traditional in-person learning to online learning may be a highly unique experience for both students and professors. Through numerous internet-based stages, the educational system and teachers have committed to "Training in Emergency," yet they are being driven to accept a framework for which they are unprepared. 8 E-learning tools were essential throughout this outbreak. 9

Helping schools and colleges work with understudies to help them get the swing of things during the end of schools and colleges Staff and understudy preparation should be assessed and upheld effectively as they acclimate to the new adjustments. It's challenging for pupils who have the right mentality to adapt and change. 10

However, students that have a growth attitude rapidly acclimate to a new setting. There is no one teaching method that works for everyone in web-based learning. There are several topics with various requirements. For various themes and older audiences, several online teaching strategies are needed (A Webb, 2021). 11

Internet growth also enables students who are geographically separated to take part in education in a virtual setting with only minimal effort. As schools were shuttered due to the global pandemic, students, parents,

and teachers suffered the unexpected and steadily worsening repercussions of the COVID-19 epidemic. 12

While lawmakers, modern workers, and health officials make a determined effort to calm the flare-up, educational institutions work to continue providing high-quality education for everyone during these challenging times. Many students living at home or in dorms have experienced emotional and mental problems and are unable to form meaningful connections. ¹³ Investigation on the standard practices for online self-teaching is still ongoing. The ability and willingness of both instructors and students to use information communications technology (ICT) could be a determining factor in the use of reasonable and appropriate instructional methods for online education. Some of the web-based platforms used up till now include platforms for group communication and coordinated work. 14

For instance, the resources Microsoft Teams, Google Classroom, Canvas, and Blackboard enable instructors to design interesting lessons, study guides, and skill-development programs. They offer ways to do business, hold video conferences, and store records that make running lessons straightforward and organized. 15

The sharing of a wide range of files, including Word, PDF, and Excel documents as well as audio, video, and other sorts of data, is often supported. Through the use of examinations and the grading of submitted projects using a rubric, these also make it possible to monitor and evaluate the learning of understudies. The "flipped study hall" is a quick way for disseminating learning materials before class, such as articles, prerecorded recordings, and YouTube videos. 16 The discussion with the team and friends during online homeroom is then used to further comprehension. This approach is highly effective in enhancing abilities like independent learning, critical thinking, and rational decision-making. The usage of flexible cloud-based learning platforms like Elias, Moodle, Big Blue Button, and Skype as well as other virtual classroom tools like video conferencing is expanding (P RIAZ, A literature Investigation on Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on Teaching and Wisdom., 2021). ⁴

Encounters in Instruction and Knowledge Due to the abundance of platforms and online learning resources available, teachers and

students who use or refer to them frequently run into problems. 17

Here is an overview of some of the points made and emphasized by various analysts:

Issues with e-learning include openness, moderation, adaptation, learning teaching technique, long-lasting learning, and instructional strategy. Many countries oppose access to modern devices and a steady Internet connection. The expense of internet learning tools is often out of reach for young people in developing countries, yet webbased teaching offers a risk that the student will be open to more screen time. ¹⁸

Students must now actively participate in autonomous learning and self-exploratory learning. Since both parents work, a further challenge is the lack of parental supervision, particularly for younger students. Different learning methodologies benefit from realworld workplace issues. The naturally gifted students are relatively unaffected in their learning since they require the least administration and guidance, but the weak group of students, which comprises of pupils who are powerless in learning, encounter challenges. A few academically talented students from low-income backgrounds cannot access or pay the cost of online education. 19

The level of academic achievement of the students in the classes held for both the year-end evaluation and the internal assessment is expected to fall due to reduced student interaction time and the absence of teacher interviews while addressing learning/acquisition challenges. There is a lot of experimentation, openness, and perplexity among the instructors, understudies, and parents when it comes to the internet evaluations of students. ²⁰

The approach taken to conduct internet-based assessments varies depending on the flexibility and aptitude of the instructors and the degree of student similarities. Due to the significant understudy population, many schools and organizations still lack the proper procedures to prevent literary theft. ²¹

Due to the lockdown of schools and institutions, A levels have declined across the board for the entire partner in the UK. Internal evaluations and assessments for more open capacities like General Certificate of Secondary Educations have also been impacted by this (GCSE). Depending on how long the lockdown lasts, deferment or abrogation of the complete evaluation appraisal may not be a good possibility. board Numerous state-level enlistment exams, college-level exams, and selection tests throughout India have been postponed as a result of the COVID-19 flareup and countrywide lockdown.

The current state of affairs has had a considerable impact on the educational

system in colleges, institutions, and schools all around the nation. ²²

It's also feasible that the interferences would help some students' careers. For instance, it was agreed that all tenth grade understudies in Norway would obtain a secondary school diploma. According to a French research, the abandonment of the traditional assessment method in France in response to the student riots had positive long-term effects on the companion's labor market. instructional time is not entertaining for them, but it also increases their level of engagement and mindfulness. ²³ While away from the regular academic schedule, understudies experience financial, social, and mental effects on their existence. Children are now defenseless against online abuse because many of these kids are taking online courses and investing more time in virtual environments. Children are spending more unstructured and dangerous amounts of time learning online, which exposes them to more significant risks like cyberbullying. ²⁴ More families are relying on innovation and cutting-edge solutions to keep kids interested in learning, engaged, and connected to the outside world as a result of school closures and stricter regulations, but not all children have the necessary knowledge, skills, and resources to protect themselves online. Due to the availability of online education in Bhutan, the majority of pupils come from rural areas with ignorant ranchers as the majority of their parents. Students assist with ranch activities parents agribusiness, watching over cows, and family chores. 25

Some students even suggested moving test times to later in the day because they needed to work in the fields in the morning. A few students mentioned that they needed to care for their frail parents, grandparents, or other family members and take them to emergency rooms. When they return home before sundown, it gets more difficult for them to keep up with the examples. Guardians of children in lower grades believe it would be wiser to let the children repeat the previous academic year. Despite the awful availability of the Internet, the majority of students don't use their phones or televisions at home. ²⁶

Due to the closure of businesses and workplaces, the enormous population receives no salary or receives less compensation. When compared to standard pay obtained, the information bundle (costs) are also substantial, and ongoing Internet access is an expensive business for the developing locality. The majority of students are in favor of online face-to-face lessons (video), but some students who are

financially strapped have complained that these classes require additional information packages. The teachers are having trouble deciding who to focus on and which technologies to use. ²⁷

Pre-recorded recordings are thought to be beneficial; nevertheless, this would restrict partnerships. Planning a suitable framework that can accommodate evolving needs and accommodations is difficult, all else being equal.

Occasions for Instruction and Education

Despite the fact that online training from a different perspective has presented overwhelming challenges for educators, schools, organizations, and the government, the COVID-19 pandemic has created some incredible opportunities for those with limited resources and distant plans to implement e-learning frameworks. ²⁸.

It has resulted in a stronger bond between teachers and parents than at any other time. The self-teaching expects parents to support their children's academic and financial advancement. During this ongoing crisis, children with disabilities require extra and extraordinary help. For the first time ever, the use of online platforms like Google Classroom, Zoom, virtual learning environments, web-based media, and diverse group chats like Telegram, Messenger, What's App, and We Chat is being researched and pursued for teaching and learning. Even after face-to-face showing stops, this can still be researched further. ²⁹

The pupils may receive additional resources and training throughout these phases. Teachers must encourage the creative urges that aid in overcoming the challenges of online instruction. At the local level, educators are successfully working together to advance internet teaching techniques. ³⁰

Due to the fact that teachers, parents, and students all have similar experiences, there are special opportunities for engagement, creative problem-solving, and the capacity to learn from others and try new tools. To aid in and promote teaching and learning in a more intelligent and engaging environment, many educational groups are giving away their tools and solutions. Web-based education has provided an incredible opportunity to educate and learn in inventive ways that are different from the teaching and development options in the usual study hall setting. ³¹

DISCUSSION

The pandemic, which affected over 1.725 billion children and youth from pre-essential through advanced school, afflicted 98.6% of the population in 200 nations. Making learning possible and accessible through self-

teaching has therefore been of utmost importance. 32

Web-based learning does not make sense with the same teaching methods that are available and used for face-to-face instruction. Despite the fact that a variety of teaching techniques have been developed for online and distance learning, instructors who are mechanically in reverse need legitimate professional turn-around and preparation to position themselves towards their students authentic evaluations and convenient input are crucial components of learning. ³³

The ability of web-based students to get helpful developmental evaluations and timely input is a crucial aspect of online distance learning. This is thought to be challenging for the faculty and the educational system. Due to the larger class sizes, lack of a web-based displaying framework and professional events, and the non-participative attitude of the students, it is more moving in the Bhutanese context. ³⁴

In training circles, the usual term is Maslow before Bloom. This should be the goal of web-based education in order to keep students in school throughout the current pandemic. Before beginning internet learning, the phrase is often used to make sure that our pupils are secure and that their basic needs are met. ³⁵

Due to the fact that there are so many offenders at home or nearby, aggressive behavior at home and child abuse are on the rise, endangering the students' mental health. Understudies are currently forced to teach themselves due to the COVID-19 epidemic, therefore the family environment is not consistently suitable for all social norms and economical situations. Studies should be conducted to assist the most financially disadvantaged groups. ³⁶

There have been stories of understudies quitting or deciding to discontinue tutoring in Bhutan. The extended break that the school administration permitted during the COVID-19 pandemic is what led to this. A closer study at this region would highlight the observable nuances even if no studies have been conducted to establish the pandemic's immediate influence on dropout rate. In order to survive this pandemic, many educational companies have assembled a selection of free to use internet tools. For all of the students from different financial backgrounds, the reasonableness and accessibility of these internet-based foundations remains challenge. ³⁷

Students with special needs or learning difficulties, such as those who have hearing loss, vision impairment, or mobility

problems, require additional preparation in addition to direction and support. The inability of many parents and guardians to uphold these values at home interferes with this group of students' capacity to learn. In order to find the best solutions for these students' special educational needs (SEN), one must invest time and money in this research. Due to the fact that all of the activities and examinations for understudies are conducted at home, it is difficult for teachers to evaluate the accuracy of the work and the real learning that is occurring. ³⁸

Throughout the learning cycle, parents support and guide their children, although the amount of assistance varies greatly. Because no legal guidelines have been developed and are actually used, evaluating understudies is another topic of research. ³⁹

CONCLUSION

In spite of the fact that many studies have been conducted, it is assumed in the review of the COVID-19 pandemic's effects on teaching and learning around the world that, because non-industrial countries, appropriate teaching methods and stages for various class levels of higher optional, center, and essential schooling should be further investigated. Because of the web's constrained channel count and high cost of information bundles relative to average incomes in many developing countries, openness and reasonableness are insufficient.⁴⁰

It is hoped that strategy-level mediation will help the current situation move forward. Additional examination and investigation of efficient online teaching and learning approaches are among the research topics. The need for developing tools for accurate assessments and timely criticism is another topic of research.⁴¹

A test that the creator of educational tools could focus on customizing is the moderation and openness for each student with a different financial basis. It is also crucial to intercede at the approach level. Bhutan's educational system, like those across the world, must contribute to the professional development of teachers, with a focus on ICT and effective instructional methods in light of the current scenario. The other area of inventive work involves creating web-based applications that demonstrate intelligence, creativity, and originality using simple-to-understand tools.

This would benefit students and prepare the educational system for future weaknesses. The COVID-19 epidemic serves as an illustration of how teachers and students should be prepared to use a variety of internet-based instructional tools. Instructors

and students should be encouraged to continue using these web-based tools after the COVID-19 epidemic when the regular classes start in order to boost teaching and learning. 43

ETHICS APPROVAL: this article does not need ethical review / approval

FUNDING: The work was not financially supported by any organization. The entire expense was taken by the authors

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS: We are thankful to all contributors/researchers who were involved in this study.

AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS: All persons who meet authorship criteria are listed as authors, and all authors certify that they have participated in the work to take public responsibility of this manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST: No competing interest declared.

REFERENCES

- 1. Chiong-Rivero H, G. R. Patients' and caregivers' experiences of the impact of Parkinson's disease on health status. *Patient related.* 2011 Mar;2011(2):57-70.
- 2. Salem, T. Honor Killings of Palestinian Women: A Critical Analysis. *dspace.cuni.cz.* (2020). https://dspace.cuni.cz/bitstream/handle/2 0.500.11956/171432/120412411.pdf?seq uence=1&isAllowed=y
- 3. Hjálmsdóttir A, V. B. I have turned into a foreman here at home": Families and work–life balance in times of COVID-19 in a gender equality paradise. *Gender, Work & Organization,*. (2021). Gender Work Organ.2021;28:268–283.
- 4. RIAZ P, M. R. A literature Investigation on Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on Teaching and Wisdom. *Journal of Contemporary*. Journal of Contemporary Issues in Business and Government 2021: Vol. 27, No. 5,. 577-584
- 5. Agu CF, J. S. COVID-19 pandemic effects on nursing education: looking through the lens of a developing country. *International nursing*. 2021 Jun;68(2):153-158.
- 6. Khan SA, M. Y. The Impact of Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Lockdown on Education Sector of Azad Jammu & Kashmir. *Humanities and Education*, 2021 Volume 2, Issue 2: 19 26
- 7. Robosa J, N. P.-I. (The experiences and challenges faced of the public school teachers amidst the COVID-19

pandemic: A phenomenological study in the Philippines. IJARIIE Vol-7 Issue-1 2021 - 2395-4396

- 8. Spilker MJ, M. R. Mission Possible": supporting of an adoption of a distance learning model for schools during the pandemic. *Future of the Educatio*. (2021).251-264.
- 9. Alsoud, AR A. H. The impact of covid-19 pandemic on student's e-learning experience in Jordan. *Journal of Theoretical and Applied Electronic.* 2021, 16(5), 1404-1414;
- 10. Qiu Q, Z. X. Belief change before and after the teaching practicum among Chinese pre-service ELT teachers. *Sage Open*, (2021).1-12.
- 11. Webb A, R. M. Moving learning online and the COVID-19 pandemic: a university response. World Journal of Science, Technology and Sustainable Development, (2021). 18 (1), pp. 1-19.
- 12. Hasan, M. Exploring GPS teachers experience of online teaching in Dhaka City during COVID19 pandemic. dspace.bracu.ac.bd. (2021). http://dspace.bracu.ac.bd/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10361/15948/19357039 BIED.pdf?sequence=1
- 13. Benton, C. Perspectives of Young Adolescent African American Middle School Females Using Social Media. search.proquest.com. (2019). https://www.proquest.com/openview/c99 42ceddf24a6bc18c5aa1156115a22/1.pdf?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=18750&diss=y
- 14. Farcas A, J. K. Use of incident command system for disaster preparedness: a model for an emergency department COVID-19 response. *Disaster medicine and*. (2021).1-6 https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7371845/
- 15. Vinci C, M. H. Transition to telehealth: Challenges and benefits of conducting group-based smoking and alcohol treatment virtually. *Contemporary Clinical*. 2022 Mar; 114: 106689. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/a rticles/PMC8785408/
- 16. Laquey, M. Learning Alone, Practicing Together: A Case Study Exploring the Flipped Classroom to Improve Interpreter Education. *digitalcommons.wou.edu*. (2021).1-59. https://digitalcommons.wou.edu/cgi/vie
 - https://digitalcommons.wou.edu/cgi/vie wcontent.cgi?article=1082&context=the ses
- 17. Pokhrel S, R. C. A literature review on impact of COVID-19 pandemic on teaching and learning. *Higher Education*

- *for the Future,*. (2021). <u>Volume: 8 issue:</u> 1, page(s): 133-141
- 18. Alexander, B. *Academia next: The futures of higher education.* (2021). https://www.amazon.com/Academia-Next-Futures-Higher-Education/dp/1421436426
- 19. Comunale, M. Getting into the game: An explanatory case study to examine the experiences of faculty incorporating digital game based learning in higher education. *search.proquest.com*. (2017).1-168. https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/190321662.pdf
- 20. Rafiq MS, X. J. Intelligent query optimization and course recommendation during online lectures in E-learning system. *Journal of Ambient Intelligence and*. (2021). **12**, pages10375–10394
- 21. Haskins AR, W. J. Schools as surveilling institutions? Paternal incarceration, system avoidance, and parental involvement in schooling. *American Sociological Review*. (2017). Volume: 82 issue: 4, page(s): 657-684
- 22. Liu W, X. Y. Response to the COVID-19 epidemic: the Chinese experience and implications for other countries. *International Journal of Environmental*. 2020 Apr; 17(7): 2304.
- 23. Viglas M, M. P. Effects of a mindfulness-based program on young children's self-regulation, prosocial behavior and hyperactivity. *Journal of Child and Family*(2018)., Vol. 27, Iss. 4, 1150-1161..
- 24. Chmylevska, N. Inductive Analysis of Preventive Policies at Comprehensive Schools: Improving Their Effectiveness Through Metapolicy. *helda.helsinki.fi.* (2021).14-150.
- 25. Nwachukwu IR, R. A. Framing of the coverage of herdsmen/farmers clashes by punch and guardian newspapers (2016-2018). *Innovative Journal of* . (2021). Volume 9, Number 1, 1-15.
- 26. Hamby S, E. T. Privacy at the margins| technology in rural Appalachia: cultural strategies of resistance and navigation. *International Journal of.* 12(2018), 1248–1268.
- 27. Crittenden WF, I. B. Embracing digitalization: Student learning and new technologies. *Journal of Marketing* 2018. <u>Volume: 41 issue: 1, page(s): 5-14</u>
- 28. Ma G, K. B. Higher education under threat: China, Malaysia, and the UK respond to the COVID-19 pandemic. *Compare: A Journal*. (2021). Pages 841-857
- 29. Chen X, X. H. Construction of novel 2D/1D g-C3N4/CaTiO3 heterojunction with face-to-face contact for boosting

photodegradation of triphenylmethane dyes under simulated. *Journal of the Taiwan Institute of* . (2020). https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/ Construction-of-novel-2D%2F1D-g-C3N4%2FCaTiO3-with-for-Chen-He/8fcb3d5fc8a9ad2793fd8e1d3ae51f44 bae8daee

- 30. Caena F, C. R. Aligning teacher competence frameworks to 21st century challenges: The case for the European Digital Competence Framework for Educators (Digcompedu). *European Journal of Education*, (2019). Eur J Educ. 2019;54:356–369
- 31. Jalil NA, H. H. Machines learning trends, perspectives and prospects in education sector. *International Conference on Education*. (2019). Pages 201–205
- 32. Hobbs NT, R. H. Alternatives to statistical hypothesis testing in ecology: a guide to self teaching. *Ecological Applications*,. (2006). 2006 Feb;16(1):5-19. https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/167059
- 33. Jubaer S, L. H. The Concept of Education: A Western Rationalist Approach. *International Journal of Educational* . (2021). Volume 4, Issue 6 June 2021 | 138-150.
- 34. Willett, A. Indigenous knowledge and its implication for agricultural development and agricultural education: a case study of the Vedic tradition in Nepal. search.proquest.com. (1993). https://dr.lib.iastate.edu/handle/20.500.1 2876/63727
- 35. GOWRI, S. Online Learning Performance On E-Learning System. Scholar: National School of Leadership, (2019). Education and Information Technologies volume 26, pages 6923–6947 (2021).
- 36. Flint DJ, R. W. Customer value change in industrial marketing relationships: a call for new strategies and research. *Industrial marketing management*, (1997). https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.106.8855&rep=rep1&type=pdf
- 37. Fugate M, A. K. A dispositional approach to employability: Development of a

- measure and test of implications for employee reactions to organizational change. *Journal of Occupational and*. (2008).
- https://bpspsychub.onlinelibrary.wiley.c om/doi/epdf/10.1348/096317907X24157 9
- 38. Fathurrochman, I. Online Evaluation System in the Pandemic Disruption in Madrasah: Opportunities and Challenges Based on Qualitative Report. *Jurnal Iqra': Kajian Ilmu*. (2021). http://repository.iaincurup.ac.id/663/5/Irwan-Iqra%20Sinta2.pdf
- 39. McGarigal K, S. C. Comparative evaluation of experimental approaches to the study of habitat fragmentation effects. *Ecological applications*, . (2002). Vol. 12, No. 2 (Apr., 2002), pp. 335-345
- 40. Waghid, Y. Pedagogy out of bounds: Untamed variations of democratic education(2014).1-99.
- 41. Hinkin, T. A review of scale development practices in the study of organizations. *Journal of management*,. (1995). https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/do wnload?doi=10.1.1.466.8045&rep=rep1 &type=pdf
- 42. Maravilhas S, J. M. Strategic knowledge management in a digital environment: Tacit and explicit knowledge in Fab Labs. *Journal of business research*, (2019). vol. 94(C), pages 353-359.
- 43. Groves MM, P. Z. Instructional technology adoption in higher education: An action research case study. *International Journal of Instructional*. (2000). Vol. 27, Iss. 1, 57.

Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License

(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), **Attribution-Share Alike CC BY-SA**. This license lets others remix, adapt, and build upon your work even for commercial purposes, as long as they credit you and license their new creations under the identical terms